



LAX/COMMUNITY NOISE ROUNDTABLE

Recap of the Regular Meeting of November 9, 2016

Roundtable Members Present

Carl Jacobson, City of El Segundo
Blake LaMar, City of Palos Verdes Estates
Robert Nemeth, City of Rancho Palos Verdes
Dinesh Ghiya, City of La Habra Heights
Anthony Anderson, City of Los Angeles – Council District 8
Omar Pulido, City of Los Angeles – Council District 11
Danna Cope, LAX Area Advisory Committee
Martin Rubin, North Westdale Neighborhood Association
June Lehrman, City of Culver City
Teresa Real Sebastian, City of Monterey Park
Jim Withrow, City of Inglewood
Polly Low, City of Rosemead
Vivian Romero, City of Montebello
Terry Boyle, Federal Aviation Administration
Scott Tatro, LAWA

LAWA and Consultant Staff

Kathryn Pantoja, LAWA
René Spencer, LAWA
David Chan, LAWA
Steve Alverson, ESA

Guest Speakers

Barry Davis, FAA
Brian Fagan, FAA

A quorum of the members was present.

1. Welcome/Review of the Meeting Format

Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson welcomed everyone to the meeting and reviewed the meeting format. Mr. Alverson indicated that the Roundtable meetings are facilitated in order to stay on topic and on schedule. He noted that there is a period for public comment on the

agenda and that the Acting Roundtable Chair may permit additional comments on other agenda items as time permits.

2. Call to order, Pledge of Allegiance, and Identification of Those Present

Acting Roundtable Chairman Carl Jacobson called the meeting to order at 7:01 p.m. PST in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX. Member Cope led the Roundtable members and audience in the pledge of allegiance. Roundtable members and members of the audience introduced themselves and stated their affiliations.

4. Comments from the Public

Acting Chairman Jacobson opened the public comment period and asked that speakers keep their remarks to three minutes in length. Upon seeing that there were no requests for public comment, Acting Chairman Jacobson closed the public comment period.

3. Roundtable Membership

LAWA staff member David Chan acknowledged the receipt of five letters related to Roundtable membership. Two of the letters appointed new representatives for the City of Monterey Park, Teresa Real Sebastian, and the City of Rancho Palos Verdes, Robert Nemeth. Two other letters were membership requests from the City of Rosemead and the City of Montebello. Mr. Chan noted that according to the Roundtable Bylaws, no action is required for membership changes/requests from city jurisdictions.

The fifth letter was a membership request from the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association (BPNA) appointing Laurie Smith as the BPNA representative. Mr. Chan noted that the Bylaws require Roundtable approval of a community organization's request for membership. Member Cope noted that the Roundtable does not know what BPNA's aircraft noise concerns are and made a motion to postpone voting on BPNA's membership request until those concerns are understood. Member Rubin seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

4. Work Program A13 – North Downwind Arrival Study

LAWA representative Scott Tatro introduced Federal Aviation Administration representatives Barry Davis and Brian Fagan from the SoCal TRACON in San Diego, who are providing FAA's response to the Roundtable letter on LAX North Downwind Arrivals. Mr. Fagan reviewed the role of the SoCal TRACON in handling air traffic over the Los Angeles Basin. He noted that air traffic is very unpredictable and FAA's mission is to safely and efficiently move aircraft through the National Airspace System. He showed images of the radar screens that air traffic controllers use to guide aircraft into and out of LAX noting that there are no roads or city boundaries. He displayed radar flight tracks for one day of jet air traffic indicating that the airspace over the Los Angeles Basin is the most complex in the United States.

Mr. Davis explained that the FAA had reviewed the North Downwind Approach (NDA) Study that showed a several-month narrowing of the NDA corridor and found no explanation for why the NDA flight tracks narrowed. He noted that there were some controller techniques and tools that were used, but the times did not coincide with the narrowing of the flight tracks. He also indicated a willingness to find a way to notify the Roundtable of upcoming air traffic changes, but is not sure at this point how that process will work.

Mr. Fagan described the SADDE SEVEN STAR, which brings aircraft onto the NDA, as an on-ramp to LAX airspace. He indicated that aircraft on the STAR are at 7,000 feet above mean sea level (MSL) passing over or near the Santa Monica VOR and then descend to 2,600 feet MSL in order to ensure the required separation from aircraft on final approach from the east. He explained that the required separation from other aircraft is 3 nautical miles horizontally or 1,000 feet vertically. He showed an image depicting a sample of flight tracks for October 31, 2016 during Instrument Flight Rules (IFR) conditions, which typically cause the Extended Downwind Approach (EDA). He explained that if pilots cannot see other aircraft, FAA must provide the required separation. He noted that FAA would prefer not to use the EDA, as controllers have to handle each aircraft longer and it uses more fuel and creates more air emissions. He also noted that controllers are seeing operations in real time and do not have the benefit of visual landmarks such as streets. Therefore, it is impossible for controllers to detect what appears to them as small changes in flight track locations on the radar screens.

A member asked if the closure of Santa Monica Airport (SMO) would change the NDA altitudes and flight path. Mr. Fagan explained that SMO currently has no effect on the NDA altitudes and flight path, so a closure would not affect the NDA altitudes and flight tracks. A member asked if aircraft could cross the SMO VOR at 10,000 feet or higher. Mr. Fagan explained that crossing the SMO VOR at 10,000 feet or higher would place more aircraft over Monterey Park and points further east due to the descent angles of modern-day aircraft. He noted that extending the NDA approach further east would create a conflict with air traffic at other airports.

A member noted more frequent traffic over La Habra Heights. Mr. Fagan said that air traffic is on the rise again, so the frequency of aircraft operations has been increasing. He noted that air traffic volume is airline industry driven. LAX Airport Traffic Control Tower representative Terry Boyle added that in addition to the increase in aircraft operations, the fleet mix has changed with more large aircraft operating at LAX, which increases spacing requirements between aircraft on the NDA and, in turn, results in increased use of the EDA.

A member explained that the NDA Study concluded that there have been no changes in aircraft operations over Culver City despite the community's perception that aircraft are lower and louder. Another member expressed concern that the EDA issue over Monterey Park had not been resolved. LAWA representative Scott Tatro noted by way of correction that the NDA Study did not conclude there were no changes in aircraft operations: the Study found that the fleet mix has changed over the past six years and that arrivals on the NDA were up 20 percent during that period. He indicated that the EDA has been a community concern since 1998 and a Roundtable Work Program item since the early 2000s.

A member asked if the FAA planned to do additional research to put to bed the issue of why the flight tracks narrowed for a period of several months. Mr. Fagan explained that it would require listening to specific controller instructions, to be in the cockpit to see how the pilots executed the direction, and to see what the winds and weather were at that particular time. He added that these data are no longer available, so the FAA will not be able to provide further clarification on this issue.

Acting Chairman Jacobson opened this item for public comment. Several attendees noted the increased frequency of aircraft operations and noise over Culver City, Malibu, and Monterey Park.

The FAA's North Downwind Approach Study Response presentation can be found at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

5. Work Program A7 – Extended Downwind Approach

Following up on a continued agenda item, Roundtable Facilitator Steve Alverson reviewed the eight measures that had been recommended by Monterey Park resident at the July 13, 2016 Roundtable meeting. Mr. Alverson evaluated each of the recommendations and provided his independent assessment and suggestions for the Roundtable's consideration.

After reviewing Monterey Park recommendations, Mr. Alverson suggested the Roundtable discuss the merits of these recommendations and do one of the following:

- Take action on any one or all of them
- Take no action
- Defer taking action until after Metroplex implementation

LAWA representative Scott Tatro suggested that the Roundtable defer taking action until after the Metroplex implementation to determine whether the proposed North Downwind RNP procedure would provide any benefit. Member Real Sebastian requested that this item be heard no later than the second quarter of 2017.

A resident of Monterey Park requested that the Roundtable meet with the FAA to explore what can be done to address these concerns. LAWA representative Scott Tatro explained that the FAA has addressed all of the concerns that have been raised and explored options to reduce extended downwind approaches through the Metroplex process.

Member Pulido suggested that it might be a good idea for the Roundtable to reach out to Julie Marks, the FAA's new Community Involvement Manager for Airspace Projects, to have her discuss the FAA's strategy to address community concerns that arise after Metroplex implementation.

Member Low suggested that the Roundtable may want to consider encouraging the FAA to implement the Metroplex procedures without delay as they may reduce extended downwind approaches. Mr. Tatro noted that at least two Southern California cities, including Culver City and Newport Beach, have sued the FAA, which could delay Metroplex implementation.

The representatives from Rosemead, Montebello, and La Habra Heights requested that the monthly Extended Downwind Approach statistical report be sent to them by LAWA.

The representatives from Monterey Park and Rosemead asked whether the FAA would be reaching out to the San Gabriel Valley Council of Governments regarding the SoCal Metroplex Project. Mr. Tatro noted that LAWA may consider reaching out to more entities regarding the SoCal Metroplex Project.

The complete presentation related to "Work Program A7 – Review/Consider Monterey Park's Recommendations Regarding Aircraft Overflights" can be found on the Roundtable webpage at <http://www.lawa.org/LAXNoiseRoundTable.aspx>.

6. Roundtable Member Discussion

Member Ghiya requested that the Roundtable consider exploring possible ways to reduce aircraft noise in La Habra Heights at a future meeting.

Member Cope requested that the Work Program be projected on the video screens when specific Work Program items are on the agenda for discussion at future meetings. Member Cope also suggested that the FAA incorporate the runway protection zones into land use planning. Mr. Alverson noted that land use planning falls under the purview of each local municipality.

Mr. Chan noted that LAWA received one response to its Request for Proposals on the Roundtable Facilitator contract, which was from Environmental Science Associates (ESA). He noted LAWA negotiated with ESA and arrived at a three-year, \$300,000 not-to-exceed contract which will go to the Board of Airport Commissioners on November 17, 2016 for approval. He added that the contract includes a provision for additional Roundtable meetings should they be needed.

Member LaMar noted that United Airlines announced plans to modify all of their A-320 family of aircraft with vortex generators to reduce a high-pitched tone that occurs on approach. Mr. Chan noted that working with the airlines at LAX to retrofit their aircraft with vortex generators is Roundtable Work Program Item A12 and LAWA is working to have United give a presentation to the Roundtable on their retrofit program.

Member Nemeth noted an uptick in the frequency of overflights of Ranch Palos Verdes (RPV). LAWA staff member Kathryn Pantoja confirmed that there has been an increase in the number of turboprop overflights over RPV compared to last year due to a new cargo airline called Mokulele Airlines operating at LAX.

7. Formal Action Items and Other Requests

Formal Action Items

The Roundtable deferred consideration of the Bluff Park Neighborhood Association's request for membership to the January 11, 2017 meeting in order to gain a better understanding from the association about aircraft noise issues affecting their area, as no member of the association was in attendance.

Member Requests

Roundtable representatives from Rosemead, Montebello, and La Habra Heights requested that the monthly Extended Downwind Approach statistical report be sent to them by LAWA.

Member Pulido requested that the FAA's new Community Involvement Manager for Airspace Projects, Julie Marks, be invited to a future Roundtable meeting to explain her role and the FAA's post-Metroplex strategy for resolving aircraft noise concerns.

Member Cope requested that the Work Program be projected on the video screens when specific Work Program items are on the agenda for discussion at future meetings.

Member Ghiya requested that the Roundtable consider exploring possible ways to reduce aircraft noise in La Habra Heights at a future meeting.

After the discussion of Monterey Park's Recommendations for Work Program Item A7 – Extended Downwind Approach, the discussion of formal recommendation related to this issue was deferred until after implementation of the FAA Metroplex project. Member Real Sebastian requested that the item be heard no later than the second quarter of 2017.

8. Adjournment

Mr. Chan noted that the next regular Roundtable meeting will be held in the Samuel Greenberg Boardroom at LAX on Wednesday, January 11, 2017 at 7 pm PST. Acting Chairman Jacobson adjourned the meeting at 9:26 pm PST.